

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS**

IN RE PHARMACEUTICAL INDUSTRY
AVERAGE WHOLESALE PRICE LITIGATION

MDL No. 1456

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:

CIVIL ACTION: 01-CV-12257-PBS

ALL ACTIONS

Judge Patti B. Saris

PLAINTIFFS' RESPONSE TO THE "FAIR ALLOCATION" OF TIME MOTION

Defendants seek too much. They have examined Plaintiffs' experts almost twice the extent of Plaintiffs' examination of defense's experts and now seek to preclude either live or oral testimony under the guise of a "fair allocation."

Dr. Rosenthal submitted her rebuttal on the date the Court directed. Defendants have had sufficient time to respond and thus there is no basis as to Dr. Rosenthal for this motion.

As to Dr. Hartman, the delay is caused by Plaintiffs being forced to respond to the surprise SheetMetal chart sprung on us during the second to last day of trial.

Defendants should not complain about delay they caused. They had the SheetMetal data for a year and should have disclosed this argument when their expert reports were due.

Further, the Court will want to examine the written testimony and not forego it, as defendants suggest. It contains, among other items, charts showing that after the MMA total costs (drugs plus services) for each of the days at issue has decreased, thus undercutting defendants' no causation argument.

As to the length of the rebuttals, defendants' written expert reports covered numerous issues that could not be covered on examination in the time allocated. Plaintiffs did not complain. Now, what is sauce for the goose is sauce for the gander.

Plaintiffs suggest that the Court should proceed as planned, equal time to each side.

DATED: December 15, 2006

By /s/ Steve W. Berman

Thomas M. Sobol (BBO#471770)

Edward Notargiacomo (BBO#567636)

Hagens Berman Sobol Shapiro LLP

One Main Street, 4th Floor

Cambridge, MA 02142

Telephone: (617) 482-3700

Facsimile: (617) 482-3003

LIAISON COUNSEL

Steve W. Berman

Sean R. Matt

Robert F. Lopez

Hagens Berman Sobol Shapiro LLP

1301 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2900

Seattle, WA 98101

Telephone: (206) 623-7292

Facsimile: (206) 623-0594

Elizabeth Fegan

Hagens Berman Sobol Shapiro LLP

60 W. Randolph Street, Suite 200

Chicago, IL 60601

Telephone: (312) 762-9235

Facsimile: (312) 762-9286

Eugene A. Spector

Jeffrey Kodroff

Spector, Roseman & Kodroff, P.C.

1818 Market Street, Suite 2500

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Telephone: (215) 496-0300

Facsimile: (215) 496-6611

Marc H. Edelson
Allan Hoffman
Hoffman & Edelson
45 West Court Street
Doylestown, PA 18901
Telephone: (215) 230-8043
Facsimile: (215) 230-8735

Kenneth A. Wexler
Jennifer F. Connolly
The Wexler Firm LLP
One North LaSalle Street, Suite 2000
Chicago, IL 60602
Telephone: (312) 346-2222
Facsimile: (312) 346-0022

Donald E. Haviland, Jr.
The Haviland Law Firm
740 S. Third Street, Third Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19147
Facsimile: (215) 609-4661
Telephone: (215) 392-4400

**CO-LEAD COUNSEL FOR
PLAINTIFFS**

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I, Steve W. Berman, an attorney, caused a true and correct copy of the foregoing **PLAINTIFFS' RESPONSE TO THE "FAIR ALLOCATION" OF TIME MOTION** to be delivered to all counsel of record by electronic service pursuant to Paragraph 11 of the Case Management Order No. 2, by sending on December 15, 2006, a copy to LexisNexis File & Serve for posting and notification to all parties.

By /s/ Steve W. Berman

Steve W. Berman

HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO LLP
1301 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2900
Seattle, WA 98101
(206) 623-7292